

International Criminal Justice Series

Volume 9

Series editors

Gerhard Werle, Berlin, Germany

Lovell Fernandez, Bellville, South Africa

Moritz Vormbaum, Berlin, Germany

Series Information

The *International Criminal Justice Series* aims to create a platform for publications in the whole field of international criminal justice. It, therefore, deals with issues relating, among others, to:

- the work of international criminal courts and tribunals;
- transitional justice approaches in different countries;
- international anti-corruption and anti-money laundering initiatives;
- the history of international criminal law.

The series concentrates on themes pertinent to developing countries. It is peer-reviewed and seeks to publish high-quality works emanating from excellent scholars, in particular from African countries.

Editorial Office

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Werle
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Faculty of Law
Unter den Linden 6,
10099 Berlin, Germany
gerhard.werle@rewi.hu-berlin.de
moritz.vormbaum@rewi.hu-berlin.de

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/13470>

Cassandra Steer

Translating Guilt

Identifying Leadership Liability for Mass
Atrocity Crimes



ASSER PRESS



Springer

Cassandra Steer
Faculty of Law
McGill University
Montreal, QC
Canada

ISSN 2352-6718 ISSN 2352-6726 (electronic)
International Criminal Justice Series
ISBN 978-94-6265-170-8 ISBN 978-94-6265-171-5 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-171-5

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016958989

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2017

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer Science+Business Media B.V.
The registered company address is: Van Godewijkstraat 30, 3311 GX Dordrecht, The Netherlands

For my parents (all of them). This labour of love is thanks to your endless encouragement to seek out the world and ask the hardest questions.

Acknowledgements

Above my desk I have a quote from Carl Jung, to which I refer often: ‘The goal is important only as an idea. The essential thing is the opus which leads to the goal: *that* is the goal of a lifetime’.¹ For their contribution to this opus I am grateful to a number of people.

My mentor, Prof. Harmen van der Wilt, whose guidance was like a lighthouse, regardless of whether the skies were clear or dark and stormy. Steady, even, always truthful, ever inspiring, and truly focused. Thank you for your commitment, your insights, and for your generosity with your time.

I was supported a great deal in the comparative research I undertook in various countries by a number of generous people. In Germany at the Institut für Kriminalwissenschaften of the Georg August Universität in Göttingen I was welcomed and supported by Alexander Heinze, and am grateful also to Prof. Kai Ambos for his guidance. In the US at Cornell Law School Jens Ohlin provided hours of investigative debate and inspiring exchange of thoughts. I am indebted to him for his philosophical contributions and his all-round support. In Argentina at the Universidad Torcuato Di Tella in Buenos Aires I was welcomed by a warm community of intellectuals, and was supported in particular by Alejandro Chehtman, Hernán Gullco and Marcello Ferrante. I appreciate all their patience with my stumbling Spanish, and their extremely useful guidance on Argentine law. In Canada I was made to feel especially welcome in what I can only describe as an academic family at McGill Faculty of Law in Montreal. There Frédéric Mégret and Nandini Ramanujam took wonderful care of me as a guest of the Centre of Human Rights and Legal Pluralism. I am also grateful to the Hon. Patrick Healy, for his time, advice and candid views. And finally at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver I was treated to rich and conceptually essential debates with James Stewart, to whom I am grateful for his time, and his willingness to help me improve on my arguments in opposition to his.

¹ From *The Psychology of Transference*, para 400.

I am also grateful to the Fulbright Association of the Netherlands and to the University of British Columbia for the Mobility Research Award.

In this opus there has been a veritable team of wise and supportive people:

To the men of Cabero Stediki, Rory Kilmartin and Benjamin Dives, I am honoured to be the recipient of such a sophisticated listening and unbending support, and just as honoured to contribute to each of you as we ensure each other's success in our respective life goals.

To Alain Youell, I am blessed to have your wisdom and guidance in raising the level of growth and awareness in each of life's challenges to one of beauty and importance.

To my touchstone Bex Hronek, I am so blessed to have you by my side, and to know there is no question we cannot ask each other. To Jakob Hronek, I am grateful for your final touch of originality to this book.

To Kees Drabbe, I am indebted to you for the commitment with which you translated summaries, and for yours and Netty's omnipresent support.

To Kathryn Greenman, thank you for your ever insightful and incredibly constructive critique.

To the women of Stepping Out, the women's network at the Universiteit van Amsterdam Faculty of Law, thank you for being such an amazing network of inspiring, elegant, intelligent and powerful lawyers, academics, colleagues and friends.

To my parents and brothers, thank you for your endless belief in me, for your encouragement for me to follow my path on the other side of the world, even when this meant missing important moments in your lives. This book is dedicated to you, my family. My success is your success.

And finally to my fiancé, Sebastien, thank you for your patience, for always standing beside me, always encouraging me, and for tolerating the love affair I was having in the creation of this book, which took me away from you so many times.

Contents

1	The Problem of Liability in International Criminal Law	1
	References	6
	Cases	6
Part I Laying the Foundations		
2	Leadership Liability for Collective Crimes	9
2.1	Translating from the Collective to the Individual	11
2.2	Individual Versus Collective Guilt	12
2.3	Individual Versus Collective Agency	15
2.4	Deliberative Structures and Those Most Responsible	16
2.5	Why the Leaders?	18
	References	20
3	Putting the Leaders of Mass Atrocity on Trial	21
3.1	Efficacy and Symbolism: The Aspirations of International Criminal Law	22
3.1.1	Competing Paradigms: Accountability as a Central Goal	22
3.1.2	Symbolism: History Writing and Truth-Telling	26
3.1.3	Leadership Liability as a Prosecutorial Policy	30
3.2	Fairness and Justice: The Requirements of International Criminal Law	34
3.2.1	Fairness and the Principle of Legality	35
3.2.2	Fairness and the Principle of Culpability	38
3.2.3	Justice for Victims and for Defendants	40
3.2.4	Justice and Procedural Versus Substantive Truth	42
3.3	Designing a System of Liability in International Criminal Law	44
	References	46
	Cases	49

4	A Comparative Theory of International Criminal Law	51
4.1	International Criminal Law as Translation: From the Domestic to the International	53
4.1.1	Comparative Law as a Tool of Analysis	56
4.1.2	Legal Traditions	58
4.1.3	Legal Transplants	60
4.1.4	Legal Patchworking	63
4.2	International Criminal Law as Process	64
4.2.1	Participants as Law-Makers	66
4.3	International Criminal Law as Policy	69
4.3.1	International Law as Policy	69
4.3.2	Participants as Policy-Makers and Law-Appliers	71
4.3.3	The Policy Choice of Modes of Liability	73
4.4	The Problem of Ambiguity	74
4.5	A Comparative Law Approach to Resolving the Search for Modes of Leadership Liability	77
	References	78
	Cases	81
5	Applying the Tools	83
5.1	Functionalism	84
5.2	Selection of Jurisdictions	87
5.3	Terminology: The Problems of Translation	90
5.3.1	Unitary and Differentiated Systems	91
5.3.2	Complicity	95
5.3.3	Accessory Liability	96
5.3.4	Parties to a Crime	98
5.3.5	Guilt	99
5.3.6	Subjectivity and Objectivity as Approaches to Liability	104
	References	108
	Cases	110

Part II Leadership Liability Through a Comparative Lens

6	Subjectivity Reflected in the Common Law Tradition	113
6.1	The Common Law Tradition: A Context	114
6.2	The Old Common Law Modes of Liability	119
6.3	United States of America—Liability for the Acts of Others	122
6.3.1	Subjectivity	123
6.3.2	Vicarious or Derivative Liability for Parties to a Crime	125
6.3.3	<i>Mens Rea</i> and <i>Actus reus</i> Requirements for Accomplice Liability	128
6.3.4	Extended Liability: Further Crimes Committed by Others	130

6.3.5	Conspiracy: The Common Law Solution to Group Crimes	132
6.3.6	Summary	145
6.4	Canada—Moral Blameworthiness and the Importance of Stigma	147
6.4.1	‘Principles of Fundamental Justice’ and the Formation of Criminal Liability	148
6.4.2	Moral Innocence.	150
6.4.3	Standards of Fault for Party Liability.	150
6.4.4	Basic Party Liability.	154
6.4.5	Constructive Extended Liability.	158
6.4.6	Conspiracy: The Limited Common Law Solution to Group Crimes.	163
6.4.7	Application of Canadian Modes of Liability to the War Crimes Act	166
6.4.8	Summary	171
6.5	Legal Culture and Policy Choices in the Common Law Tradition.	174
6.5.1	Subjectivity.	174
6.5.2	Vicarious Liability	178
6.5.3	The Relationship Between the Character of Criminal Trials and a System of Liability	179
	References.	180
	Cases	182
7	Objectivity Reflected in the Civil Law Tradition	185
7.1	The Civil Law Tradition: A Context.	186
7.2	A Normative Theory of Culpability.	191
7.3	Germany: Responsibility for Control over the Act and Control over an Organisation	192
7.3.1	The Importance of Doctrine.	194
7.3.2	Culpability as Blameworthiness.	196
7.3.3	The German System of Modes of Liability	198
7.3.4	Objectivity and Control over the Crime.	201
7.3.5	Roxin’s Theory of <i>Organisationsherrschaft</i>	205
7.3.6	Summary	212
7.4	Argentina: The German Theory Applied to Leaders of Organised Mass Atrocity	213
7.4.1	Legal Transplants in Argentine Law	214
7.4.2	Objectivity and Control over the Crime.	216
7.4.3	Modes of Individual Criminal Liability	219
7.4.4	<i>Autoría Mediata</i> : Indirect Perpetration	221
7.4.5	The ‘Dirty War’ and the Criminal Responsibility of Its Leaders	224
7.4.6	<i>Autoría Mediata</i> in Subsequent Case Law.	233

7.4.7	The Impact of Argentine Case Law in the Latin American Region	235
7.4.8	Summary	237
7.5	Legal Culture and Policy Choices in the Civil Law Tradition . . .	238
7.5.1	The Relationship Between the Character of Criminal Trials and a System of Liability	239
7.5.2	Objectivity: Derivative Liability and Control over the Crime	241
7.5.3	Normative Differentiation Between Parties	242
7.5.4	Indirect Perpetration and Collective Atrocity	242
	References	243
	Cases	246
8	Shifting Trends in International Tribunals	249
8.1	Which Tradition? The Context of ICL	251
8.2	Conspiracy-Complicity: Prevalence of the Subjective Approach	253
8.2.1	The International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg	254
8.2.2	The Tokyo International Military Tribunal	259
8.2.3	Military Trials Under Control Council Law No. 10.	260
8.2.4	After the Second World War Trials: Rejection of Conspiracy	261
8.3	Command and Superior Responsibility: Leadership Liability as Omission	263
8.3.1	Command Responsibility	265
8.3.2	Superior Responsibility	268
8.4	Planning, Instigating and Ordering: Forms of Encouragement	269
8.4.1	Planning	270
8.4.2	Instigating/Soliciting/Inducing	271
8.4.3	Ordering	272
8.5	Aiding and Abetting: Hidden Controversies	274
8.5.1	Complicity and Aiding and Abetting	275
8.5.2	Aiding and Abetting as a Catch-All for Leadership Liability	277
8.5.3	Manipulation of the Law-Making Process	278
8.6	Joint Criminal Enterprise: Extended and Constructive Liability	280
8.6.1	The Inception of a New Mode of Liability	281
8.6.2	The Question of Sources for JCE	283
8.6.3	The Reification of JCE	286
8.6.4	Rejection of JCE at the ICC	292
8.7	Co-perpetration: Towards an Objective Approach	293
8.7.1	Co-perpetration at the Ad-Hoc Tribunals	294
8.7.2	Co-perpetration at the ICC: Control over the Crime	297

8.7.3	Balancing the Subjective and Objective Elements of 'Control over the Crime'	299
8.8	Indirect Perpetration/Perpetration by Means: A Normative Differentiation	301
8.8.1	A New Mode of Liability on the International Plane.	301
8.8.2	Perpetration by Means of an Organisation.	302
8.8.3	Towards a Reification of Perpetration by Means of an Organisation	306
8.9	Indirect Co-perpetration by Means of an Organisation: Extended Liability	309
8.10	The Question of Differentiation Between Parties to a Crime	313
8.10.1	Functional Unitarity at the Ad-Hoc Tribunals	313
8.10.2	Normative Differentiation at the ICC.	315
8.11	Legal Culture and Policy Choices in the International Tribunals.	317
8.11.1	The Relationship Between the Character of International Criminal Trials and a System of Liability	318
8.11.2	Policy Shifts	319
8.11.3	The Influence of Participants on the Shifts Between Subjectivity and Objectivity	321
8.11.4	Vicarious or Derivative Liability?	323
	References.	324
	Cases	329

Part III Patchworking a Solution to Leadership Liability

9	Applying a Comparative Theory: Beyond Legal Transplants, Toward Legal Patchworking	337
9.1	Observing the Patchworking Process.	338
9.2	Strengthening the Patchworking Process.	340
9.3	Reversing the Traditional Doctrine of Sources: How the Subsidiary Sources Have Become Primary	343
9.3.1	The Rome Statute as an Internally Referencing Source.	344
9.3.2	Treaties as Primary Sources?	345
9.3.3	The Limits of Custom and Principles of International Law	345
9.3.4	The Relationship Between General Principles and Domestic Law	348
9.3.5	The Role of Judicial Decisions	349
9.3.6	Scholars as Participants and Doctrine as a Source.	350
9.3.7	A Different Hierarchy of Sources	351
9.4	Are Modes of Liability in International Criminal Law <i>Sui Generis</i> ?	353

References	355
Cases	357
10 Translating the Guilt of Leaders of Mass Atrocity	359
10.1 Layers of Translation	360
10.2 In Defense of a Normatively Differentiated System of Liability	363
10.2.1 Liability and the Goals of International Criminal Law	364
10.2.2 Objectivity as a Doctrinal Choice: A Better Fit for the Context of ICL	368
10.2.3 A Normative Theory of Culpability	371
10.2.4 Deliberative Structure as a Basis for Distributing Liability	374
10.3 Sentencing or Qualification: Should Modes of Liability Do the Work of Differentiation?	377
10.4 Fair Labelling	380
10.5 Who Would You Rather Dine With? The Mastermind or the Executioner	383
References	385
Cases	388
Appendix A: Full Texts of Articles on Liability	389
Index	397

Abbreviations

BGH	<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i> (German Federal Court of Justice)
BiH	State Court of Bosnia Herzegovina
CJM	<i>Codigo de Justicia Militar</i> (Argentine Military Code of Justice)
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
IACHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICL	International Criminal Law
ICRC	International Committee for the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
ILC	International Law Commission
IMT	International Military Tribunal
ISIS	Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham
JCE	Joint Criminal Enterprise
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army (Uganda)
MCP	Model Penal Code (United States of America)
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
PTC	Pre Trial Chamber
RUF	Revolutionary United Front (Sierra Leone)
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
StGB	<i>Strafgesetzbuch</i> (German criminal code)
STL	Special Tribunal for Lebanon
UN	United Nations
USA	United States of America
WCA	War Crimes Act 2000 (Canada)